## "Postmodern ecofeminist theories and politics"

## Lejla Mušić<sup>1</sup>

## Department of Sociology, Faculty of Political Sciences Sarajevo, Skenderija 72, Bosnia and Herzegovina

#### Abstract:

Postmodern ecofeminist theories as the key theories for transnational and global cooperations and peace agreemants offer the global approaches towards the democracy, as they involve analyzes of intersection of contemporary ecological problems, social system, and gender problem. The juxtaposed nationalism results in ethnocentrism, sexual racism, ethnical racism (Vlaisavljević 2009, 179-209). Environmental nationalism as a project, rejects all three forms of discrimination proposing the idea of supranational and transnational unions based on need for ecological problems solution. Therefore the borders of nation-states, should be moved towards the wider areas of bioregional cooperation, and communal care for climate changes. Ecofeminist Eislar Rian in her work *Ecofeminist manifesto* (1987) holds that the social system of Minoan period of rule on Greek island Crete, was the only true democracy. Deconstruction of gender dichotomies results in transgender society. Contemporary sociological perspective includes transnational identities. . "Environmentalist nationalism represents superior form of nationalism, because of its luck for tendentiousness towards the racism, ethnical violence and militarism, it is rather based on bioregionalism" (Galić 2000, 34).

Key terms: ecofeminist, gender, ecology, nation, ecological nationalism,

### Introduction

#### Introduction

Ecofeminist Eislar Rian in her work *Ecofeminist manifesto* (1987) holds that the social system of Minoan period of rule on Greek island Crete, was the only true democracy. The Athenian democracy, was the rule of free aristocratic males, women and slaves (man and women of other color) were marginalized and excluded from public sphere. Only free males were subject to obligation of public speeches as a mark of true citizen. Patricia Shipley holds that Aristotle's scripts on social system represent the origin of misogyny and subordination of women. Aristotle statements that "women are disfigured man", and "silence is an adornment of women"(Aristotle in Shipley 2001, 102), are according to Shipley origins of exclusion of women out of academic field. Metzner (Geiger 2008, 111-112) envisions the future ecological society form as liberal, egalitarian and based on gender equality. "Environmentalist nationalism represents superior form of nationalism, because of its luck for tendentiousness towards the racism, ethnical violence and militarism, it is rather based on bioregionalism" (Galić 2000, 34). Why should we accept the ecological nationalism idea? "Beck, Addam:The advancmant of advance = the advancmant of risks" (Skinner 2011, 82-82) :"Advocate for stronger participation of women in climate change institutions and processes: In addition to pushing for stronger political commitment to the principles of gender equality, it is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Lejla Mušić, Assistant Prof., Tel 0387203562, extension:149, fax:666884.

E mail: musicl@fpn.unsa.ba, musiclejla1@gmail.com

essential to advocate for greater presence of women at the negotiating tables, whether at international meetings such as the COPs or at national and regional dialogues on climate change. Conduct institutional gender audits to identify gender-blind structures and processes: Social and gender audits help to assess levels of gender blindness in climate change institutions and architecture. Conduct gender-responsive budgeting to ensure that planning, programming and budgeting contribute to the realisation of gender equality and womens rights. Dona Haraway as cyber feminist believes that societies of future will be based on transgender perspective, humanism of UN and informatics dominion. Binary opposition as crucial problem of ecology, gender, and social system had shown following division:

Femininity	Masculinity
Nature	Culture
Emotion	Ratio
Subordination	Dominance
Logic of care	Logic of dominance

#### Table 1. Femininity vs. masculinity

Postmodern	Modern
Transnational identity	Nation-state
Transgender	Gender
Transversal politic of identity(Yuval Davis)	Nation
Transnational identity	Nation-state
Transitional justice	Nation –state justice conception

#### Table 2. Postmodern vs. Modern dichotomies

#### Terms that are related to environmental nationalism idea

Beyond generalisations that place women and men in two polarised groups, stereotypes are not helpful in understanding complex realities where both women and men are both vulnerable to the effects of climate change and – in many cases – also actors in managing its responses. Therefore, there is strong intersection in between gender, nation and ecology. "Global governance, gender, and ecology as presupposed field of future problems" by sociologist Giddens. Environmental nationalism , cosmopolitan idea of nationalism, trasnationalism represent the best possible problems for this problematic intersection. Why should we embrace the environmental nationalism idea? Ecological nationalism as project rejects the racial, ethnic and sexual discrimination and promotes the idea of supranational identities formed on bases of need for better quality of life in certain areas. The concept of nation-states should be matter of past, because the areas should be divided by eco borders in order to form team of experts with common goal of formation of better life style as well as the overcoming the eco-path- psychology of postmodern time. Deconstruction involves the traditional gender dichotomies or question of natural/non-natural "involves exclusion of homosexuals, women, colored people, and non-human categories of existence "(2008, 309-

310). Sandilands demands formation of eco-polis sphere, and Ariel Salleh ecologically literate sociology. Transgender involves all kinds of perspective that includes transcending the traditional gender division or already mention gender binaries, female/male into postmodern status of feminine masculinity or masculine femininity. Philosopher Rosemary Tong (Haralambos and Holborn 2002) believes that only possible stance in postmodern is masculine and feminine at the same time, or in words of Suzana Marjanić (2005) ecological androgyny. Transnational involves the idea that the borders of nation-states should be moved towards the wider areas of bioregional cooperation and communal care for climate changes. These ideas are presented in already mentioned IPCC work of transnational team of experts. Sociologist Daniel Archibugi thinks that social system has become more of a sociological idea than it The main problems of contemporary : Femicide, Urbicide, Queer bushing, Gender based violence, Ecocide, Feminisation of poverty, Biocriminal, and negative consequences of transgenderism are girls gangs. Giddens paradox means:" Eco patho psychology of postmodernity is the fact that we are dealing with "abstract and elusive dangers, however potentially devastating they might be" (Giddens 2010, 98). Archibugi argues that cosmopolitan democracy stops the discrimination of indigenous people, strangers, emigrants, stopping the negative side of democracy, ethnocracy noticeable in "need to homogenize those who are different by means of assimilation, expulsion, or even elimination" (Archibugi in Giddens and Sutton 2010, 330). The similar is with the negative or opposite side of cosmopolitanism, or fundamentalism based on luck of tolerance towards differences. Transnational citizenship : "The EU is shown that it is possible to accompany citizenship existing inside the states in some form of transnational citizenship" (Archibugi in Giddens and Sutton 2010, 332). Human progressivism, womenism, ecological nationalism and cosmopolitan democracy, joined with ecological modernization represent significant matrix for formation of future societies and overcoming of global climate changes. Gender, ecology and social system problems are regulated properly in global legal system of cosmopolitan democracy.

#### Modern and postmodern dichotomies and divisions

Distinction between modern and postmodern theory envisioned by feminist, is followed by the traditional dichotomies of gender as social product and sex as biological or anatomic differences between women/man in modern period, and deconstruction of traditional approaches in postmodern statement that gender and sex are per formative and product of social construct. Post modernity involves plurality of identities, masculinities and femininities, that are per formative and that influence transgender perspective in postmodernism. Postmodern author Califia, in masculinity studies (Beasley 2006), has defined term transgender, and transsexuals. Transgender involves all kinds of perspective that includes transcending the traditional gender division or already mention gender binaries, female/male into postmodern status of feminine masculinity or masculine femininity. Philosopher Rosemary Tong (Haralambos and Holborn 2002) believes that only possible stance in postmodern is masculine and feminine at the same time, or in words of Suzana Marjanić (2005) ecological androgyny. Ecological androgyny is actually feminine masculinity or masculine femininity. In words of Queer feminist Judith Butler in Bodies that matter, stated that formation of femininity and masculinity is connected with transformation or transition from heterogeneous mother law of freedom, to homogenous law of father, who demands order. That is so-called period of gender socialization. Hetero-normative order of father rejects all of identities that are not heterosexual forcing them to submit to patriarchal heterosexual rule, and defining them as abnormal. On the top of the pyramid stands hegemonic masculinity, elite masculinity that holds the centers of power under their control. Co-operative masculinity supports

this kind of masculinity because of the patriarchal dividend in society. Homosexual masculinity and all sorts of subordinate masculinities (masculinities of other races, classes, and ethnicity) together with all sorts of femininity (subordinate femininity, homosexual femininity, feminists) is marginalized and subject of oppression of patriarchal rule in the same way. These masculinities and this femininities struggled and still are struggling against patriarchal rule. Even though the white feminist movement succeeded in their project, postcolonial feminist and black feminist still did not get their rights. Multicultural feminism, queer feminism, and human progressivism are together with eco feminist movements and eco feminist political activities, significant agents of change in future societies. Gayatri Ch. Speavak as postcolonial feminist, and Dianne Fuss as multiple difference authoresses in field of sexuality studies, believes that postmodern age offers different perspective, demands plural perspective on gender and sexual identities. Gayatri Speavak supports the ideas of Archibugi, developing the concept of geopolitical strategies into the example of centers of fashion in world, because centre of fashion is not Paris anymore, it is Japan, and Rei Kawakubo as feminist philosopher and prominent designer is famous name in world. Bioregionalism becomes important for regionalization and overcoming of world crisis. Transitional justice and question of collective responsibility for crimes committed, in postmodern and post transitional perspective involves relation of individual and collective consciousness and responsibility for crime as well as the dialogue in between the sides that were in war. Nenad Dimitrijevic(2011, 15-16) from Central European University question the mass crime, denial, and collective responsibility in his recent work Duty to respond :"I wish to make certain distance at the very beginning: the inspiration for me to write this book was not academic. I belong to the social group in whose name recently the heavy crimes had been committed. I am chased by the spirits of innocent people that were killed in my name. ....Hannah Arendt thinks that real question that are influenced by the issues of mass crimes involve guilt and responsibility. ... Even though I do agree with these statements, I do not agree that the emotional reaction to the crimes committed in some bodies names "totally insignificant"..." Therefore, the process of reconciliation involves the necessity of crime to be admitted and involves the need for member of collective identity to take action and take a stand in order for them to recognize the suffer of victims and those that were responsible for the crime, speaking about their own feeling of alienation inside the collective identity. In the era of ecological problems, the poverty and overpopulation are problems that concern the world in whole. Feminization of poverty is term that defines the fact that the more than half part of the poor people are women and that term poverty is more implied to women than it is to men. In period of transition and in postcolonial countries, women are living without enough resources' for life. The world is developed into the centers, peripheries and place in between. While white feminist stand in the centre of world power and from standpoint of black feminist and postcolonial authoress and feminist they in one way imitate the tradition of omnipotence and dominance of white capitalistic hierarchical masculinity religious patriarchal order. Femicide stands for higher rates of crimes committed against women. The civilization of Freud, according to Judith Butler, is the civilization of body diminishment, while as Foucault insight to the body as place of inscribtions ", thathre and surface of cultural inscription" (Butler 2000, 131). When the historical developmant of philosophical systems and thoughts is analayzed, it is necessary to notice that Butler uses multiple theories, theorethical approaches, that even though they are not contemporaries, they share the same thoughts and arguments, that support transgender and transexual perspective. Body, according to Douglas Mary, represents the form with the margins that can be threating because they are not safe enough from the outside invasions. Queer bushing, femicides, urbicides, ekocides, wars and destroying tornades are only several of the violetions artificially or naturally produced . El Salvador, Gutamala, Jŭarez, Chile, Peru, Bolivia, are places of the highest feminicides rates. Articians



in their condemnation of this brutal acts, prduced art works that condemn acts and silence over the feminicides in world. One of the most important pictures is made as pandane to Munk's *Scream*, only having female with croses inside of her mouth as symbols of feminicide in world.



Picture 1.. "Haunted nightmares of Juarez : NI UNA MAS! "(www. artsbymia.com no.6192, visited on 20.05.2014). Ecocide is ecological genocide, it involves all sorts of devastation of nature caused by so called omnipotence and power of human race, and it has complex consequences on "economic, political, technological, cultural scale, as well as on individual scale namely, in crisis of identities"(Malešević 2004, 51-53). In *The Enemy Outside :thoughts on the psychodynamics of extreme violence with special attention to men and masculinity*, Chodrow (2002, 236) writes on violence and aggressions in urban societies such as "collective cruelty, brutality, killing, torture, death squads, ethnic cleaning, political rage expressed thorough murder, rape, genocide murders of indigenous people, ethnocide tribal warfare's, gang violence, gang wars".Kira Cochrane(ed) in *Women of the revolution , forty years of feminism*(2012), together with group of feminists demarcates the places of opression in world on individual and collective plan, therefore marking the locuses of todays opression of

women as well as the single or collective protagonists of straggle. Problems of "muslim women"<sup>2</sup>(Spahić Šiljak 2012, 87-160) from misconseption of Islamic feminist movements, over systematic rape of Bosnian and Herzegovinian Islamic women, to single muslim feminist identity of Taslima Nasrin (Grant in Cochrane 2012, 171)<sup>3</sup>, that had been "sent to exile because of feminist activism with price over her head in 1994". The fight for equal tratmant and academic equality raised by single feminist such as professor Nawal El Sadawi in Egypt was stopped by dominant patriarchal authorities in 2010. Cases of individual ethnical problems such as case of Layla Ibrahim( Hattenstone and Hirsh 2012, 370) who had to spend 13 months in jail after reporting the assault to the police in Carlisle as recent as 2011, and Mona Eltahaway writtings on her own experience of feminist and jurnalist in Cairo when , "after punching man who had groped her police broke her left arm and hand"(Eltahaway in Cochrane 2012, 382) had shown that ethnical, religious freedoms and gender problems still exist as the Global risks report form 2013 had shown. Question of systematic sexual violence over the women in Congo(Wax in Cochrane 2012, 257) and contraversial question raised by Chris McGril (Cochrane 2012, 342-343) of women wining the more than a half of seats in Ruwanda parlaimant, also confirm the statemant that rising religious fanaticism still makes obstacles to democratisation of society. Queer bushing involves violence against queer persons, not because of their action but because of their beliefs. Myerson in his work Ecology and postmodernism writes that alienation results in eco pathologies of modern world, as a result of living in consciousness of ecological crisis and uncertainty of our existence. Sociologist Ulrich Beck stated in 1980-ies that we live in era of ecological problems, named risk society. We live in constant fear for ourselves Balkan stereotypes, according to Blagojević (2006, 230), can be investigated on following dichotomies:

Male	Female
Nature	Culture
Instinct	Words
Balkan	Europa
Natural	Technology
Original	Artificial
Superior	Inferior
Emotive	Rational
Constant	Changeable
Rural	Urban
War/conflict	Help/folower

#### Table 3. Balkans vs. Europe (Blagojević 2006, 230)

Recent investigation on involvement of women in religious ceremonies and rituals in Bosnia and Herzegovina had shown that women have the same role in religious ceremonies as man, "only in catholic tradition (New Travnik)" (Ivelić-Katava u Šeta et all 2013, 77, ).

# Rosi Braidotti Posthuman (2013), Haraway Cyber world, Clarisa Pinkola Estes Femina ecologica/ Ecological women, Mary Jo Deegan Femina sociologica, Xenology and femina xenologica

Ursula Wolf, in use with new types of ethics introduces, the ecological ethics as well. In her essay "Do we need the ecological ethics"?, "As the subject of moral examinations are the essences capable of suffering, care ethic, calls on emphaty as origin of moral conduct" (Ibid pp. 165-166). Rosemarie Tong<sup>4</sup>, in lecture *Globalizing of the feminist care ethic*, thinks that the overcoming of the global ecological crisis and alienation, emphathy and care ethic that is precondition of acomplishing the global egalitaranian cooperation. Ethic of care demands bioregionalism that needs to involve relations in neighborhood, the respect for natural environment, the recycling the waste, the environmental cognitions, the recognitions of environment and the ecological disasters effects onto the environment is thought of as basis for the reaction. Rosemarie Tong(Haralambos i Holborn 2002:162) supports the admittions of all " exclusionment, exiled, alienated, deviant and marginal people". In all that , it is necessary to understand that care ethic, represents the term that strongly critisizes and oposes the anthropocentrism. There are different forms of female principle, deconstruction of traditional approach to Science, changes the world perspective, and therefore the transhuman, and transcendent female principle is mentioned. Femina xenologica discovers other levels of cognitions, on the question how is it possible that Alienation regains the prefix of femininity, it is possible to reply together with Sadie Plant, who in work Zeros and ones, convincingly supporting this position with following words:

"Women were during their all work era in front of their time, taking the positions in which they could meet that changes even before they were formed, as if they were always working in future, that was only now being noticed by their male contemporaries" (Sim 2001, 51). Herbrechter defining the term posthumanity, according to newest work of Rosi Braidotti, states that it is preconditioned by developmant of ,,the new subjectivities, posthuman ethics, and affirmative posthuman politics" (www.culturemachine.com, page visited on 5.10.2014). These three conditiones enable: " construction of altrernative futures and hopes horisons" (IBID), as is it is confirmed by Braidotti. Posthuman era needs for the humanity to think outside its' own borders and therefore ,, to embrace the risks that existance of becoming different than human brings" ((IBID)). Braidotti intorduces the term critical posthumanity refering to the world in which the human and nonhuman entities have to live, on which there had been signs already in introduction of principle feminae xenologicae. Only the understanding of the posthumanity begins from enlightening the statemant that we are not all human in the same way, our humanity is different by race, classe, nation, culture, and gender, and therefore in conclusion, we can not with safety, as claimed by Braidotti, " nor we were always human nor we are only that" ( www.culturemachine.com, page visited on 5.10.2014). With maestral precisefullnes, Braidotti inscribes the quilted stich into the intersection of system, ecology, and gender, speaking the posteucentric, and posthumanistic Europe, that does not have defined systems, of contraversal global capitalistic system, which even triumphal, on the other side is not yet developed in question of the susatinable developmant and social justice, therefore the Europe alone is in the transformation process. Why is it necessary to speak on discourse of human and posthuman, questions Braidotti: " Why would we do so? Why would we do so? ", Because we have to?, Because we are people, either posthuman or to human?; Yes, but mainly, I suppose because we care for, many things, involving the people, and therefore we, have a goal, for, mainly, sustainable developmants, that can construct living reality" ( www.culturemachine.com, page visited on 5.10.2014). Questioning the intersection on gender, ecology, and system, was started by profeminist author Giddens, in final remarks of his Sociology. Clarissa Pinkola Estés offers inner psycological insight into the notion of the ,, the by birth

given/ inborn ecology of women". This inner ecology demands ethic of care that is always authentically female in it's origin but even islamic conception of God belives that all of us are presented and have to learn female principles firsth. Therefore, Estés belives in indogenous Inuit's conception of tools of the so called right women: , ,, the one that women needs to inscribe/engrave/carve/ whittle out the life for herself. Her knife cuts, tails, liberates, forms and accomadates the materials. Her notion of the fire sticks helps her to light the fire in the hardest times. Her inscriptions/carvings in the stone express her mistical knoweledges , her artistical healing and her inner personal union with spiritual world" (Estés 2009, 326). There for the femina femina sociologica, femina ecologica, and femina xenologica, are possible as complite. Vlaisavljević defines Husserl's thought on Earth as "the horison of all horisons", therefore tre defining and demistification of ethnical reality involves: " udercovering the way in which in present time the National Assembleys , national spirits and national birthplaces, are constituted" (2012, 119). Gender, ecology and national system problems are regulated properly in global legal system of cosmopolitan democracy that has to demand:

- Involvement of women, people of other color, race and sexuality into religious community as equals
- Egalitarian perspective
- Avoiding the sexism, hate against other species and racism
- Working on religious and ecological consciousness simultaneously
- Creation of world as multicultural and multi confessional space of mutual understanding and dialogue
- Feminist theologians as significant force of future change in religious consciousness towards the equality of sexes
- Bio regionalization
- Indigenization
- *Glocality* rather than locality or globalism
- World as global space with community of contemporaries sharing the same information in Global web society.

#### LITERATURE

- Adam, Barbara (2004). *Time-the key concepts*. Cornwall : Polity Press.
- Adam, Barbara(2010). Zeitvielfalt in der Evolution aus gesellschaftstheoretischer Sicht. February, Berlin : Akademievorlesung an der Berlin-Brandenburgischen Akademie der Wissenschaften,.
- Aristotle(1988). *Politika*. Zagreb : Globus.
  - Aulette , Judy Root, and Wittner, Judith(2013), Oxford :Gendered worlds.
- Bakšić-Muftić, J., Vlaisavljević U. i Babić-Avdispahić, J.(2009). Rod i nauka, Sarajevo : CIPS.
- Bek, U. (2001). *Rizično društvo*, Zagreb : Filip Višnjić.
- Cifrić, I. (2000), Znanost i društvene promijene, Zagreb: razvoj i okoliš.
- Cochrane, Kira(2012). *Women of the revolution , forty years of feminism.* London: Guardian Books.
- Connel, Raewyn(2012), Gender, Cambridge : Polity Press.

• Delveaux, M.(2001). *Transcending ecofeminism: Alice Walker Spiritual Ecowomenism, and Environmental Ethics.* University of Exeter: United Kingdom. Source: <u>www.ecofem.org/journal</u>

• Dimitrijević, Nenad(2011), *Dužnost da se odgovori*, Beograd : Fabrika knjiga.

• Dunlop, R.(2010). *A new ecological paradigm for sociology*. In Giddens, Anthony and Sutton, Robert, Sociology, Cambridge : Polity Press.



• Eisler, R. (1987) The Gaia Tradition and Partnership Future. an Ecofeminist Manifesto, in Diamond, Irene and Ornstein, Gloria, *Reweaving the World*. San Francisco: Sierra Club Books.

• *Fair Globalization'seating opportunity for all* (2004). The World Commission on the Social Dimension of Globalization. ILO Publication, April.

• Giddens, Anthony, Sutton W.Philip(2010). *Sociology:introductionary readings*, third edition. Cambridge : Polity Press,.

- Kimmel, Michael (2012), Manhood in America, Oxford : Oxford University Press.
- Kimmel, Michael(2014), Sexualities, Oxford Press: New York.

• Malory, Ch. (2008). *What Is Ecofeminist Political Philosophy? Gender, Nature, and the Political.* Sixth Annual Joint Meeting of the International Society for Environmental Ethics, Colorado: Allenspark.

- Kimmel ,Michael and Stony Brook group(2013), The gendered society Reader, Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Neitz, Mary Jo(2014), Religious and Sexual Identities: multi-faith exploration of Young adults, in Gender and society, Sociologists for Women in society(ed), journal, vol.28, august, str. 647.
- Novalić, Fahrudin(2009). *Imperij pohlepnog politeizma, izvori, ogledi iz socijalne ekologije*. Zagreb : Novi Izvori,

• Plumwood, V.(1991). *Nature, Self, and Gender: Feminism*. In Environmental Philosophy and the Critique of Rationalism, in Hypatia, VI.No 1, Spring, pp.3-27.

- Plumwood, Val(1993). *Feminism and the Mastery of Nature*. London : Routledge,.
  - Rutter, Virginia, Swartz Pepper(2012), The gender of sexuality, New York –Toronto-Plymouth: Roeman and Littlefield,.

• Salleh, A. (2001). *Ecofeminism as Sociology*. Conference of the International Sociological Association Research Committee on Environment and Society(RC24), Cambridge University, July 5-7.

• Salleh, A.(1995). *The Ecofeminism/Deep Ecology Debate*: a Reply to Patriarchal Reason, Vol.14.

• Šeta et all(2013), I moje mjesto je tu, istraživanje o poziciji i ulozi žena u tradicionalnim crkvama i vjerskim zajednicama u BiH. Sarajevo: Nahla.

• Shipley, Patricia(2000). *Racionalna żena u feminističkoj debate*. London.: Izlaganje u Ateljeu za filozofiju, društvene nauke i psihoanalizu, Jun.

• Shiva, <u>Vandana(1998)</u>. Monocultures, Monopolies, Myths And The Masculinisation Of Agriculture. At The Workshop on Women's Knowledge, Biotechnology and International Trade Fostering a New Dialogue into the Millennium during the international conference on Women in Agriculture Washington D.C., June 28 - July 2.

• Spade, Joan.Z. and Valentine G.Catherine. (2014). The Kaleidoscope of gender. London New York: Sage

• Spivak, Chakravorty, G. Kultura, u *Kritika postkolonijalnog uma*, Circulus Globus: Beograd, , u Moranjak, Bamburać, Nirman(2006). *Rod, ideologija i kultura*, Sarajevo:CIPS.

- Thompson , Martha, Armato, Michael. (2012). Investigationg gender, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Warren, Karen (1996). Ecological Feminist Philosophies. Indiana University Press: Bloomington.